

**Impact of Public-Private Partnerships in the Development of Road Infrastructure in
Some Parts of Lagos State, Nigeria**

Olusegun Kayode AHMADU

LCU/PG/002552

**Being a PhD Thesis Submitted to the Department of Urban & Regional Planning, Faculty
of Environmental Design & Management, Lead City University, Ibadan, Oyo State, Nigeria**

**In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Award of Doctor of Philosophy Degree
(PhD) in Land Administration**

2024

Certification

This is to certify that Olusegun Kayode AHMADU with matriculation number LCU/PG/002552 carried out this thesis work titled “Impact of Public-Private Partnerships in the Development of Road Infrastructure in Some Parts of Lagos State, Nigeria” in the Department of Urban and Regional Planning, Faculty of Environmental Design and Management, Lead City University, Ibadan, Oyo State, Nigeria for the Award of the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in Land Administration and this has not been previously submitted.

Prof. Grace Oloukoi
(Supervisor)

Date

Dr. Ademola Adeyemi
(Head of Department)

Date

Dedication

This Thesis is dedicated to the memory of my beloved father, Chief Amusa Ajibabi Ahmadu, who gave high priority to the educational development of his children, to the extent of self-deprivation.

Lead City University Ibadan DO NOT COPY

Acknowledgement

I want to sincerely thank my institution Lead City University for providing the platform and enabling environment for me to undergo this study. My profound gratitude goes to the Postgraduate School of Lead City University for instruction, guidance, and time-to-time monitoring to make sure we do the right thing. In attaining this goal, I acknowledge the gentle push by my secondary school mate and good friend, and now the chairman of the council of Lead City University, Professor Babajide Owoeye, sir, you are greatly appreciated; the seamless on-boarding to the faculty of a patently mature student was made possible by the unassuming, erudite and gracious Dean of the Faculty herself, Professor Grace Oloukoi. She became my mentor, my encourager and eventually the supervisor of this research. I owe you a debt of gratitude ma.

My sincere gratitude goes to our Postgraduate Co-Ordinator Dr. Kehinde Olamiju for the constant support and timely dissemination of information during this study. My special appreciation goes to other lecturers in the department; Professor S.B. Agbola Dr. A. Adeyemi, Dr. A. Adediran Dr. O. Bolukale, Dr. O. Falola, and TPL P. Ladeji for the encouragement, scholarly teaching, and guidance throughout the programme. I am also grateful to all the non-academic staff of the Department for their support and administrative help. God bless you all. My dear classmates all accorded me tremendous support and made me feel a part of them throughout the course. The two Alabis, Mr. James Alabi, Mr. O.T. Alabi, Arc. E.E. Oshike and my dear adopted niece, Mrs. Adesola Dada. My Research Assistant, Mr. Mike Lawal, leading my research team, displayed a vast understanding of conducting and interpreting research studies.

My beloved wife, Titilayomi, my children, Oluwaseyi (AbdulMajeed), Iyunola (Alakenke) and Egbinola (Adukenke) along with my grandchildren Oluwafiirekunayomi and ModesireOluwa; all

provided the invaluable family support. I must not forget my colleagues at work who spent hours on secretarial assignments.

Thank you all.

‘‘Even though the above-mentioned institutions and persons have assisted in the process of this research work, I alone stand responsible for the errors, if any, found in the work’’

Olusegun Kayode AHMADU

Lead City University Ibadan DO NOT COPY

Abstract

This study examined the impact of public-private partnerships (PPP) on the development of road infrastructure in some parts of Lagos State, Nigeria. The study employed a mixed-method approach to achieve its objectives, which included historical trend analysis, investment analysis, and evaluation of urban outcomes and public perception. The study found out that there was a significant trend of improvement in road infrastructure development in Lagos State over the past several decades, with a mean value of 258.614218 in 1994, 239.10242 in 2004, 232.567571 in 2014 and 237.563518 as of July 2024 and with a notable increase in PPP involvement in recent years through satellite imagery. The evaluation of urban outcomes with a weighted average score of 66% and a direct score of 61% using some selected indicators showed that PPP road infrastructure in Lagos State has improved road quality and maintenance and led to faster completion of road projects in comparison to solely government-led initiatives. The perception of the users of PPP road infrastructure was generally positive. The majority expressed satisfaction with the quality of the roads which was ranked 1, reduced travel cost ranked 2, increased income ranked 3, job creation ranked 4, new technologies ranked 5, improved modern road infrastructure ranked 6, reduced road congestion ranked 7, and faster delivery of services ranked 8. These findings support the hypotheses that PPP in road infrastructure development leads to improved road quality and maintenance, faster completion of road projects, and increased economic growth and development in the state at the level of significance 0.05 of F statistics being 19745.010 with a p-value of 0.000 less than 0.05, at F-statistic of 1150.256 while the p-value is 0.000 less than 0.05 and at F-statistics is 971.132 while the p-value is 0.05 respectively. This study concludes that PPP in road infrastructure development leads to improved road quality and maintenance, faster completion of road projects, and increased economic growth and development in the region. However, the study also revealed several challenges facing PPP models in Lagos State, including limited private sector involvement, lack of institutional capacity, and institutionalized corruption. The study recommends strengthening the legal and institutional framework for PPP, greater collaboration between government and private sector partners to improve project initiation, design, supervision, and implementation, reducing corruption through enforcement of penalties, and involving local communities in the planning and monitoring of road projects. These critical factors and challenges should be considered for the successful implementation and sustainability of PPP in the sector.

Keywords: Public-Private Partnership, Road Infrastructure Development, Lagos State, Nigeria.

Word Count: 390

Table of Contents

Content	Page
Title Page	i
Certification	ii
Dedication	iii
Acknowledgement	iv
Abstract	v
Table of Contents	vi
List of Tables	x
List of Figures	xii
List of Acronyms	
Chapter One: Introduction	
1.1 Background to the Study	1
1.2 Statement of the Problem	4
1.3 Justification for the Study	5
1.4 Aim and Objectives of the Study	7
1.5 Research Questions	8
1.6 Hypotheses	8
1.7 Scope of the Study	8
1.8 Operational Definition of Terms	9
Endnotes	11

Chapter Two: Literature Review

2.1	Conceptual Review	13
2.1.1	The Concepts of Public-Private Partnership (PPP)	13
2.1.2	Types and Models of PPP	17
2.1.3	Examples of PPP Models Globally	30
2.1.4	Examples of PPP Models in Nigeria	32
2.2	Theoretical Framework	34
2.2.1	Economic Perspective Theory	35
2.2.1.1	PPP as a Monitoring Game in Economic Perspective Theory	36
2.2.1.2	Implication of Economic Perspective Theory to PPP in Road Infrastructure in Lagos State	37
2.2.2	Collaborative and Network Governance Perspective Theory	39
2.2.2.1	Implication of Collaborative and Network Governance Perspective Theory to PPP in Road Infrastructure in Lagos State	40
2.2.3	Frame and Institutional Perspective Theory	41
2.2.3.1	Frame and Institutional Perspective Theory as Sensemaking	43
2.2.3.2	Implication of Frame and Institutional Perspective Theory to PPP Road Infrastructure in Lagos State	44
2.3	Review of Empirical Studies	46
2.3.1	Impact of PPP in Road Infrastructure Development	46
2.3.2	Challenges of PPP Road Infrastructure in Nigeria	49
2.3.3	Benefits of PPP	51
2.3.4	PPP Success Factors	52

2.3.4	Factors that Influence PPP Effectiveness	56
2.3.5	Perceptions of Stakeholders on PPPs	60
2.3.6	Conceptual Framework for Public-Private Partnership PPP	62
2.3.7	PPP and Infrastructural Development in Lagos State	64
2.4	Conceptual Model of PPP	66
2.5	Summary of Literature Reviewed	70
	Endnotes	71
 Chapter Three: Methodology		
3.1	The Study Area	81
3.1.1	The Location and Position of the Study Area	81
3.1.2	Historical Background of the Study Area	82
3.1.3	Population Growth of the Study Area	84
3.2	Research Design	85
3.2.1	Phase 1: Data Collection (Primary Data)	85
3.2.2	Phase 2: Literature Review (Secondary Data)	86
3.2.3	Phase 3: Spatial Data	86
3.2.3.1	Raster Data Sets	87
3.3	Population for the study	88
3.4	Sample and Sampling Technique	88
3.4.1	Sample Frame 1	88
3.4.2	Sample Frame 2	89
3.4.3	Sample Frame 3	89
3.4.4	Sample Frame 4	89

3.4.5	Sample Frame 5	89
3.4.6	Sample Frame 6	90
3.5	Description of the Instruments	98
3.6	Validity of the Research Instrument	99
3.7	Reliability of the Research Instrument	100
3.8	Method of Data Collection	100
3.9	Method of Data Analysis	100
3.9.1	Objectives and Research Questions of the Study	101
3.9.2	Interview and Focus Group Discussion	101
3.9.3	Research Hypotheses	101
3.9.4	Satellite Imagery (Spatial Data)	102
	Endnotes	105

Chapter Four: Results and Discussion of Findings

4.1	The Trend of Road Infrastructure Development in Lagos State (Pre- and Post-Post-Independence)	106
4.1.1	Population Growth of Lagos State	115
4.1.2	The Trend of Road Infrastructure Development in Lagos State	119
4.1.3	The Trends in Public and Private Investment in Road Infrastructure in Lagos State.	138
4.2.1	Features of the PPP Law	139
4.2.2	Procurement	140
4.2.3	Service Charges, User Fees, and Tolls	141

4.2.4	House of Assembly	142
4.3	Prospects and Problems of the Public-Private Partnership PPP Model in Lagos State	146
4.3.1	Socio-Economic Characteristics of Respondents	146
4.3.2	Distribution of Respondents by Gender	146
4.3.3	Distribution of Respondents by Marital Status	147
4.3.4	Distribution of Respondents by Highest Educational Qualification	148
4.3.5	Distribution of Responses by their Professional Engagement in the States PPP and Other Establishments	149
4.3.6	Distribution of Respondents According to Years of Experience	150
4.4	Urban Outcomes of the PPP Model in Road Infrastructure Based on Some Indicators	158
4.4.1	Socio-Economic Characteristics of Respondents	158
4.4.2	Distribution of Respondents by Gender	160
4.4.3	Distribution of Respondents by Marital Status	161
4.4.4	Distribution of Respondents by Highest Educational Qualification	162
4.4.5	Distribution of Responses by their Professional Engagement in the States PPP and Other Establishments	163
4.4.6	Distribution of Respondents According to Years of Experience	164
4.4.7	Key Indicators to Evaluate the PPP Model for Road Infrastructure Development in Lagos State	165
4.4.8	Case Studies of PPP Road Infrastructure Development in Lagos State	168
4.4.8.1	Lekki -Epe Expressway and Lekki Ikoyi Link Bridge	168

4.4.8.2	Mile 2- Oworonsoki	169
4.4.8.3	Oniru Road Network	171
4.4.8.4	Zenith Road Victoria Island	172
4.4.8.5	Fourth Mainland Bridge (Under Construction)	173
4.5	Perception of Users of PPP Road Infrastructure in the Study Area	187
4.5.1	Perception of Commuters on PPP Road Infrastructure in the Study Area	189
4.5.2	Socio-Economic Characteristics of Respondents (Commuters)	197
4.5.3	Gender Distribution of Respondents	197
4.5.4	Age Distribution of Respondents	197
4.5.5	Marital Status of Respondents	198
4.5.6	Distribution of Respondents by Highest Level of Education	199
4.5.7	Commuters' Perception of Travelling along the Route (PPP Road)	199
4.5.4	Commuters' Perception of Rating of PPP Road Infrastructure in the Area	201
4.5.2	Commuters' Perception of Challenges of PPP Road Infrastructure in the Area	202
4.5.3	Commuters' Perception of PPP Road Infrastructure Furniture in the Selected Areas	203
4.5.7	Commuters' Perception of the Condition of PPP Road Infrastructure Furniture in the Selected Areas	205
4.5.8	Perception of PPP Road Users (Transport Workers)	207
4.5.8.1	Perceived Impact of PPP Road Infrastructure on the Services of Transport Workers and Commercial Drivers in the Motor Parks of the Study Area.	208

4.5.8.2 Impact of PPP Road Infrastructure on the Transport Services Workers and Commercial Drivers in the Motor Parks of the Study Area.	210
4.5.4 Perception of PPP Road Users (Shops and Business Owners)	212
4.5.5 Socio-Economic Characteristics of Respondents (Shop and Business Owners)	214
4.5.6 Perceived Impact of PPP Road Infrastructure on Shops and Business Owners along the PPP Roads	217
4.6 Hypotheses	219
4.7 Discussion of Findings with Existing Literature	224
Endnotes	227
 Chapter Five: Conclusion	
5.1 Summary of Findings	229
5.2 Conclusion	232
5.3 Recommendations	234
5.4 Contribution to Knowledge	240
5.5 Suggestions for Further Studies	241
 Bibliography	244
Appendix I	256
Appendix II	259
Appendix III	261
Appendix IV	265
Appendix V	270
Appendix VI	272

Appendix VII	276
Appendix VIII	280
Biodata	286
The University Compliance Certification	288
Lead City University Turnitin Result	289

List of Table

Table	Title	Page
3.1	Detailed Information on Satellites Images Used in this Study	87
3.2	Sample Frame for Government Ministries in Lagos State	91
3.3	Sample Frame for the Office of the Public-Private Partnership Lagos State Government	91
3.4	Sample Frame for Private Agencies Partnering with Lagos State Government on Road Infrastructure Development	92
3.5	Names of Banks on PPP in Lagos State	92
3.6	Construction Companies on PPP in Lagos State	93
3.7	Other Establishments on PPP in Lagos State	93
3.8	Sample Frame for Allied Transport Workers and Commercial Drivers Using PPP Roads in Lagos State	94
3.9	Sample Frame for Commuters using PPP OADS IN Lagos State	95
3.10	Sample Frame for Shops and Business Ownes along PPP Roads in Lagos State	96
3.11	Key Indicators to Evaluate the PPP Road Infrastructure in the Study Area	98
4.1	Population Growth of Lagos State, 1966-2024	116

4.2	Statistics of Road in 1995	121
4.3	Statistics of Road in 2004	125
4.4	Statistics of Roads in 2014	128
4.5	Statistics of Roads in 2024	131
4.5 (a,b & c)	Statistics of Government Funded and PPP Roads in Lagos State Between 1994 and 2024	134
4.6	Distribution of Respondents by Gender	147
4.7	Distribution of Respondents by Marital Status	148
4.8	Distribution of Respondents by Highest Educational Qualifications	149
4.9	Distribution of Respondents by Professional Engagement	150
4.10	Respondent's Year of Experience	150
4.11	Mean Ranking of Prospect Factors of PPP Road Infrastructure Development	151
4.12	Problems of PPP Road Infrastructure Development in Lagos State	156
4.13	Distribution of Respondents by Gender	161
4.14	Distribution of Respondents by Marital Status	162
4.15	Distribution of Respondents by Highest Educational Qualifications	163
4.16	Distribution of Respondents by Professional Engagements	164
4.17	Distribution of Respondents According to Years of Experience	165

4.18	Key Performance Indicators (KPI) and Performance Measures (PM)	176
4.19	Initial Evaluation of Case Studies	177
4.20	Enhanced Evaluation of the Success Criteria	179
4.21	Assessment of the Level of Performance of PPP Road Infrastructure Development	181
4.22	Project Level of Performance Ranking	183
4.23	Sampled Commuters for the Study	193
4.24	Distribution of Respondents by Gender	197
4.25	Distribution of Respondents by Age	198
4.26	Distribution of Respondents by Marital Status	198
4.27	Distribution of Responses by Highest Educational Qualification	199
4.28	Frequency of Route Usage	200
4.29	State of PPP pad Infrastructure in the Study Area	201
4.30	The Challenges of PPP Road Infrastructure Development in the Selected PPP Roads in Lagos State (Ranked by Mean)	203
4.31	Identification of PPP Road Infrastructure in the Selected PPP Roads	205
4.32	The Condition of PPP Road Infrastructure Furniture in the Study Area	206
4.33	Sampled Transport Workers for the Study	208
4.34	Socio-Economic Characteristics of Respondents (N=32)	209

4.35	Professional Diving Experience of Respondents	210
4.36	Impact of the PPP Road Infrastructure in Lagos State	211
4.37	Sampled Shops and Business Owners	213
4.38	Distribution of Respondents by Gender	214
4.39	Educational Qualifications of Respondents (Shop and Business Owners)	215
4.40	Distribution of Respondents by Marital Status	215
4.41	Distribution of Respondents According to Years in Business	216
4.42	Distribution of Respondents by Business Engagement	216
4.43	The Impact of PPP Road Infrastructure on Shops and Business Owners	218

List of Figures

Figure	Title	Page
2.1	PPP Framework in Road Infrastructure Development	64
3.1	The Study Area: Lagos Nigeria	82
4.1	Lagos State in 1850	111
4.2	Lagos State in 1900	112
4.3	Lagos State in 1950	113
4.4	Lagos State in 2000	114
4.5	1994 Road Network Map	120
4.6	2004 Road Network Map	124
4.7	2014 Road Network Map	127
4.8	2024 Road Network Map	130
4.9	Road Network Pattern between 1994 and 2024	133
4.10	Colour Composite Landsat Imagery between the years 1994 and 2024	136
4.11	Public-Private Partnership Roads in Lagos State	143
4.12	Route Usage of Respondents	200
4.13	Respondents Rating of PPP Road	202

List of Plates

Plate	Title	Page
4.1	Lekki-Ikoyi Bridge	169
4.2	Lekki-Ikoyi Bridge	169
4.3	Lekki-Epe Expressway	169
4.4	Lekki-Epe Expressway	169
4.5	Mile 2-Oworonsoki	170
4.6	Mile 2-Oworonsoki	170
4.7	Oniru Road Network	172
4.8	Oniru Road Network	172
4.9	Zenith Road VI	173
4.10	Zenith Road VI	173
4.11	Fourth Mainland Bridge (Under Construction)	175
4.12	Fourth Mainland Bridge (Under Construction)	175

List of Acronyms

Abbreviation	Meaning
PPP	Public-Private Partnership
IRR	Internal Rate of Revenue
LASTMA	Lagos State Transport Management Authority
FRSC	Federal Road Safety Commission
LSPPPB	Lagos State Public Private Partnership Bureau
BOT	Built Operate Transfer
BCR	Benefit Cost Ratio
NPV	Net Present Value
CSF	Critical Success Factor
DBO	Design-Build-Operate
BOOT	Build-Own-Operate-Transfer

Lead City University Ibadan DO NOT COPY